CHAPTER 2: REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Outsourcing is a persistent and controversial topic among librarians. Generally, there is no objection on outsourcing of non-library or non-core functions. On the other hand, when outsourcing is used for library core functions like cataloguing, classification etc. it becomes a topic of heated criticism in library professionals with laying off implications for library staff. However, a lot of literature is available on using outsourcing in acquisition, technical and other processes of all types of libraries. Library literature reflects a continuing discussion on outsourcing of such routine library operations as collection development, materials selection, materials processing, cataloguing, and management. The available literature consists articles related to implementation of outsourcing in libraries, editorial, critiques, praises on use of outsourcing however not much on the impact of outsourcing in libraries.

The literature reviewed shows an interesting difference in outsourcing practices in the Indian libraries as compared to the libraries worldover. It is discovered that internationally most of the libraries outsourced both Professional-Manual as well as Professional-Automated activities and services whereas Indian libraries outsourced more Professional-Automated activities and services and Non-Professional. Because at present the Indian libraries are eagerly engaged in replan, restructure and reengineer their processes of work flow to fulfill the increased expectations and requirements of the ICT savvy users, facing the problems of shrinking budgets and non-availability of the required staff, so they consider outsourcing as a tool to improve their services, to maintain goodwill and reputation. However, internationally libraries have now moved one step ahead of Indian libraries and have started using crowdsourcing in libraries for various tasks like tagging, database error corrections, collection of the rare pictures and digitization of manuscripts etc.

Outsourcing is a heavily studied issue and a lot of literature is available on outsourcing in general and in different areas. However, this literature
review only covers the literature related to the field of Library and Information Science published in the form of Books, Research Articles, Research Reports, Annual Reports, Ph.D. Thesis and Master Dissertations etc. from 2000 to 2012.

2.1 REVIEWS

Dunn (2012) prepared a draft for outsourcing the management of the Upland Public Library to Library Systems and Services, Inc. (LSSI). He mentioned that LSSI was offering an increased level of service for less cost to the library and there was no evidence in support that LSSI could not effectively run the library. In addition, the Upland City Council retained all the library’s assets, including the buildings, collection materials, furniture, fixtures and equipment, as well as control over the library’s policies. Therefore, library manager need to negotiate a three year contract with LSSI for the management of the library.

Gupta and Sharma (2012) studied the status and future trend of outsourcing in science and technology libraries in Delhi. They found that most of the Indian libraries had been using selective outsourcing since many years, which had had favorable impact on these libraries. Further they reported that libraries wanted to continue and expand the use of outsourcing in future too, especially for Digitization, RFID Tagging and Maintenance. However, maximum libraries outsourced professional-automated and non-professional activities and services as compared to professional-manual activities and services.

Heather (2012) outlined the outsourcing issue in public libraries. She concluded that from 1997 to 2007, thirteen library systems were outsourced and then from late 2007 to early 2010 there were no new contracts. Since 2010, five more systems had been outsourced and the international interest was growing. Communities in the United Kingdom explored outsourcing and recent challenges in the Toronto Public Library System had flamed rumors of possible outsourcing. It should also be noted that all municipalities that had made the decision to outsource the management and staffing of their libraries to a contractor were all still under contract, except two. The Calabasas Public Library switched back to public management in mid-2007 and the Lancaster
(Tex.) Veterans Memorial Library changed back to public management in October 2008. The future of public library management outsourcing was unclear. It seemed a stalled trend in early 2010 now appears to be a swiftly growing phenomenon. The municipalities that had considered outsourcing their libraries in the last few years might have been looking for a monetary fix as the economy took an extreme downturn. Substantial savings had yet to be proven.

Madhusudhan and Nagabhushanam (2012) examined the web-based library services offered by 20 Indian university libraries in different sections via their websites. They reported that most of the university libraries planned to use outsourcing for the present library services to develop as web-based library services.

Sharma and Gupta (2012) studied the extent of outsourcing used in human resources in science and technology libraries of Delhi and Chandigarh, India and the attitude of the library staff towards outsourcing. They explored the hidden practices of Indian libraries to fulfill the gap of the required and available human resources. However, library professionals hesitate to accept openly that outsourcing is a tool for managing resources and services that are not available in-house. Further they reported that outsourcing seems a viable solution as majority of the libraries are having lack of the required permanent human resources.

Bhatt (2011) reveals the current trends of university libraries in India. He reported that outsourcing of the various jobs was one of the new trends in Indian university libraries. Though, the major reasons to opting outsourcing was the downfall in the work culture in the government organisations, but slowly and gradually, it became an identifiable feature of university libraries, especially for the jobs such as cataloguing and classification, retro-conversion, stocktaking, compilation of bibliographies, automation of the library, etc.

Castagne (2011) discussed the history of outsourcing in USA library technical services departments throughout the 20th century and focused on the outsourcing debate in the 1990s concerning quality, efficiency and staff/user
impact when library used vendor for materials selection and catalogue records. He reported that the majority of libraries were satisfied with vendors work and one day outsourcing would be simply considered ‘resource sharing’. He also discussed the new issues related to cataloguing e.g. ongoing evolution of a cataloger’s responsibilities, the increase in demand for digital resources, a proliferation of metadata technologies and the influence of consortia etc. and concluded that catalogers successfully adapted all these changes.

Romero (2011) reported that the technological, economic and sociological challenges of the information society were demanding the development of new ways to manage human resources in organizations, ways that allow a greater degree of flexibility leading to innovation and the strengthening of competitiveness. He concluded that outsourcing alone did not improve the productivity and performance of information units. It required an effort to adapt and to work jointly with other organizations and it was also necessary for the institution to be prepared to change the way it would work and willingness to accommodate this type of activity.

Dhiman and Sharma (2010) elaborated the idea of outsourcing and its uses and prospects in library field. They also differentiated the concept of outsourcing with privatization. They concluded that there were numerous redundant and unskilled tasks that could be outsourced without sacrificing something essential from the library profession. Library professionals must hold onto and nurture those tasks which were considered essential to the essence of librarianship. Otherwise the profession would lose its core values and open itself up to additional attacks from outside the library.

Koganuramath and Angadi (2010) reported hiring of one library professional with computer skills for 18 and 10 months respectively for the digitization of two periodicals namely Sociological Bulletin and Indian Journal of Social Work under two major projects carried out in the library of Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS), Mumbai.
Macroplan Australia Pty Ltd (2010) analyzed the costs and benefits of outsourcing public library services, (namely acquisitions, cataloguing and processing) in a variety of contexts relevant to the New South Wales (NSW) public library network. Outsourcing of collection procurement, cataloguing and processing in a public library context became common in libraries throughout Australia. Outsourcing was an important decision which needed to be considered in an evidence based framework. They suggested that outsourcing on a library by library basis could achieve a Benefit Cost Ratio (BCR) of around 2.0 to 2.3. This range of benefit was considered relatively significant compared to other potential government projects. Typically projects with BCRs less than 2.0 were not considered significant. They found that outsourcing provided opportunities to re-distribute staff more efficiently and effectively across more value adding activities as opposed to back of office processes.

Ugah (2010) mentioned that current economic conditions had caused Nigerian University libraries to consider outsourcing as a tool in effort to cost cutting, improving efficiency and to meet increasing demands for accountability of some library services. He discussed the pros and cons of outsourcing and proposed library services that could most easily be outsourced viz. Cataloguing, Catalogue Card Production, Book Pockets, Book Cards, Borrowers' Tickets, Binding and Book Repair, Photocopying and Indexing and Abstracting. He concluded that outsourcing was a topic of considerable interest. The experience of those who outsourced services seemed generally positive and resulted in cost-saving, reduced staff redundancy and enhanced users satisfaction. Outsourcing could be a practical and prudent solution to certain aspects of librarianship. Outsourcing might be a good career alternative to a traditional full-time job for librarians. No one could imagine what the future holds in terms of the economy, which was a great determinant of funding the universities and their libraries. No one could predict how technology would change the role of libraries and librarians. Outsourcing of
some library services might become a more attractive option to fulfill the particular university library's needs.

**Bansode and Desale (2009)** mentioned that with the recommendation of experts the initial work of RFID was outsourced in Jayakar Library, University of Pune. Creating a database of around 4, 50,000 books was a huge task, which took about 3 years to complete. The library was not in a position to complete this task by using its existing staff, who were busy in carrying out routine work. So, library management hired outside workers for data entry operations and pasting of tags in the books. The total cost of the outsourced activity was US$ 28,125.

**Hasegawa (2009)** studied the management structure of special libraries in Japan with full-time outsourcing and revealed three outsourcing trends in special libraries. First, the management of the system was shared by the entruster, the contractor, the contract workers and the host organization. Second, **special libraries were operated under two conditions: ones common to almost all the libraries and others that were unique to some. Some of the former and all of the latter seem to be necessary for the general management of full-time outsourcing.** Thirdly, there were two typical forms of management: entruster-centered and contract worker-centered. He concluded that in order to maintain and improved the library's services, the entruster should take a position of leadership in libraries with full-time outsourcing. Reasonable limits should be set on the contents of the work done by contract workers; planning and selection of materials should be excluded from these contents. In addition, the contractor should make every possible effort to understand the library's operations and offer professional development opportunities to the contract workers in order to improve the quality of the contract workers.

**Hill (2009)** in her P.hD. thesis explored the documents of the contracting process using Norman Fairclough’s (1993) critical discourse analysis in order to understand what voices are privileged in the discourse surrounding the
outsourcing of public library management. She found that the contractor had an enormous power in defining contract because the RFPs (Request For Proposal) were normative and maximum contract management criteria was decided by the contractor. She suggested that outsourcing of public library management was rather an unexplored area of research, there were numerous options for future research. Outsourcing in public libraries is a smaller phenomenon but it had increased substantially in the last few years. Between 1997 and 2003, four communities outsourced their library systems; in 2004, three; in 2005 and 2006 two and in 2007 five libraries outsourced their management and staff. Future research would be needed on the macro level, exploring the causes and strategies that led to outsourcing and at the micro level, exploring the experiences of the individual communities and libraries. She concluded that further research on the outsourcing of library management would be beneficial to the field of librarianship.

Press and Information Bureau, Govt. of India (2009) reported improvement in security arrangements by engaging a private agency in addition to its own regular watch and ward duty staff. It also outsourced and engaged students and persons with proficiency in regional languages to process (i.e. catalogue and classify) books in standard systems that were followed in the National Library. The old collection of the imperial library had also been included in this project. It further reported outsourcing to an agency the stock verification of collections in five languages, viz. Assamese, Gujarati, Kannada, Malayalam and Punjabi covering more than 1,53,000 books.

Petry-Eberle and Bieg (2009) reported that Corporate Information Centre of a Germany based global corporation used outsourcing due to limited resources in the following sections viz. library services, subscription services and acquisition, online content resources, research, information technology activities and vendor portfolio management. They stated that with limited resources, the skilful use of outsourcing solutions made possible the redevelopment of strategy and therefore change. They concluded that
outsourcing was an important way to realize a new business model without an increase in resources.

**Robertson (2009)** studied the outsourcing of Shelf Ready Services in Brisbane City Council Library and described the myths about outsourcing in libraries viz. outsourcing in libraries lost control over the acquisition process; suppliers did not know their customers’ needs; it only worked for big libraries and cataloguing work was poor etc. He reported that libraries had more control in outsourcing because they were working on the process not in the process and monitored the system constantly. Further he suggested that outsourcing was completely scalable and economical for all libraries instead of only big libraries.

**Satija and Sarbinder Kaur (2009)** reported outsourcing of the union catalogue preparing services to Informatics India by INDEST consortium.

**Sato and Itsumura (2009)** studied the correlation between library and information education and outsourcing in academic libraries in Japan. They revealed that in recent years, academic libraries in Japan had increasingly been outsourcing their functions. They found that there was a significant correlation between state of outsourcing in academic libraries and the state of library and information education in Japan. The state of outsourcing in academic libraries was varying from region to region. The technical services and public services outsourcing rate was highest in Kinki and second highest in Tokyo and Tokai respectively. In a region that had many people with library certifications, and many universities that offer library certification, academic library outsourcing would be widely used because they could not work at libraries as full time staff and they became the human resource for outsourcing.

**Vasishta (2009)** suggested that in the process of RFID implementation fixing of tags to document can be initially outsourced.

**Yusuf (2009)** surveyed the management of change in cataloguing practices in Covenant University and University of Lagos, Nigeria and found various developments that were taking place in the ICT era viz. Resource-sharing of
cataloguing activities, outsourcing of cataloguing activities and online cataloguing. He reported that outsourcing of cataloguing became necessary as a result of backlogs experienced by libraries that were newly automating their services. It served as an alternative means for eliminating the backlogs in libraries and cataloguers adopted outsourcing as a strategy to cope with the changes in cataloguing.

CCLA Technical Services Standing Committee (2008-09) explored the practice of outsourcing technical services functions in Florida College Libraries. Committee mentioned the types of activities that might be outsourced and provided some insight on whether or not outsourcing be the right approach for a college library to take. It was clear that no single solution would fit every library. Different libraries might choose different outsourcing functions to suit their specific situation. Vendor services reflected these differences as they tried to satisfy individual library’s needs. Using outsourcing services in a library’s technical services department continued to be a very controversial topic among many librarians. The idea of paying a vendor to perform a task that could also be done in-house could be a bit disconcerting to staff who were worried that their positions would be eliminated by the use of this practice. In most cases, libraries that were using outsourced services were doing so not to replace existing staff but because they lacked the personnel in technical services to do the needed work in the first place or had concluded that a vendor could provide bibliographic records and/or physical processing at a faster pace than the library could. As technical services staff shranked and positions were assigned to other areas of the library, outsourcing was seen as a tool that helped libraries complete the tasks necessary to process new materials without directly adding new personnel. Further, the committee also pointed out some caution and alternatives to outsourcing as well as some best practices to follow if a library decided to implement outsourcing.
Bansode and Periera (2008) surveyed library automation in thirty six college libraries of Goa State and found that surveyed libraries were not outsourced the automation work. Majority of the libraries having traditional barriers such as insufficient funds, lack of trained staff, and lack of space were faced by a majority of the libraries. However, they suggested that retrospective conversion of documents and other jobs related to automation might be outsourced to complete the automation of the library.

Dollfuss (2008) reported that Medical University Library of Vienna held a contract with MPS technologies for the process of COUNTER (Counting Online Usage of Networked Electronic Resources) and listed some important points which had to be considered and discussed in the library before the outsourcing of the usage data collection of electronic resources. MPS technologies collected usage data from publisher platforms on behalf of the library and pulled them together into uniform spreadsheet reports. Additionally several statistical analysis were generated based on the consolidated reports.

Kin (2008) investigated the challenges and concerns of IT outsourcing in an IT department within Malaysian Public University Library. He reported that libraries stored enormous and tremendous volumes of reading materials and archives and handled vast variety of users. Thus, IT outsourcing became an important strategy for any library and service providers were committed to provide libraries (service user) the best available resources in computer systems, networking and application technologies. IT outsourcing enabled libraries to improve service at reduced cost. He indicated that managing service providers’ timely service delivery seemed to be of utmost concern in the IT department. He concluded that future of IT outsourcing in relation to library was promising. Library reading materials and archives would be in digital form on the creation of digital library.

King and Terzi (2008) studied whether or not the technical service operations consisting primarily of the acquisition, cataloging, and physical processing of materials should be outsourced at Big Valley County Public
Library System (BVCPLS). A successful outsourcing venture would depend on clearly communicating the libraries needs and expectations to potential vendors, determining which vendor would provide the best service for the specific functions needed and carefully creating a contract to reflect those expectations. Outsourcing acquisitions, cataloging and physical processing tasks would allow BVCPLS staff to devote more time and resources to its mission of serving the public while reducing technical services costs. Perhaps more importantly, outsourcing may enable librarians to better meet the library users’ information needs. They reported that with a reliable vendor and an explicit contract, BVCPLS would analyse the financial savings, receive current imprints in a timely manner, improve the accuracy, consistency and speed of cataloging and make the best use of its librarians’ expertise by expanding services that only professional librarians could deliver. If the contracting of technical services became more accepted by BVCPLS, librarians would insist upon higher standards and their demands would likely improve the quality of services and products provided by vendors. Perhaps more importantly, outsourcing might enable librarians to better meet the library users’ information needs.

Limbachiya (2008) described that outsourcing had grown tremendously with the arrival of the computers and growth of communication technologies. Indian libraries had been using outsourcing for their functions from a long time. He stated that outsourcing could be done for cataloguing, classification, preservation, shelving, photocopying, binding, translation, bar coding, members’ identity cards, indexing, database management, computerization and purchases products or services. Further, he reported various reasons for using outsourcing in libraries e.g. library and information professionals could concentrate on core activities, to reduce operating and training costs, to provide best quality services and value-added services, to ensure customer satisfaction etc. He mentioned outsourcing should be used as a strategic tool to become flexible and competitive as a company. Outsourcing was a potential tool to lower overall costs and improve the quality of library services and products.
But he also opined that outsourcing of technical services was not suitable for every library. However, outsourcing of library services were a proven solution for more than 15% of Indian schools. Outsourcing in school libraries were commonly used for the preparation of databases and subscribing magazines. He suggested that outsourcing also opened up new avenues to entrepreneurship among the new generation of library professionals.

Qiu and Xiao (2008) reported that focus shift and outsourcing in university libraries acquisition and cataloguing were among the trends of re-composition and optimized allocation of social resources in market mechanism in China. These would help to improve the quality of document construction as well as the efficiency of acquisition & cataloguing and allocate human resources in a more reasonable way. He stated that outsourcing had become a usual practice in libraries. Further he concluded that outsourcing practice would not only encourage libraries to think over how to save their costs and improve their efficiency but also help them to renovate their operational processes and conduct re-composition. He believed that outsourcing would have greater scope for development with the modernization of university libraries now and in the future.

Robertson (2008) discussed the three typical outsourcing models in public libraries: first the library does all selection, cataloguing and processing in-house, often with very customized processing, second the library fully outsources acquisition and supply of shelf-ready library material and third library purchases using a combination of the above. Further he mentioned that outsource selection was done due to economies of scale, to buy more books/content, use supplier business knowledge and expertise to add value – they became a partner in meeting customer needs, more staff with customer focus, facilitated growth in programming, including children and adult learning. He also outlined the benefits of outsourcing viz. selection and shelf-ready services saved money, more efficient, partnership with supplier added value, used library staff for customer service and programming, library
maintained control of collection and library got more time for strategically management and innovation.

**Sato and Itsumura (2008)** surveyed the outsourcing in academic libraries in Japan and found that 90% of academic libraries outsourced some services. Non-professional services like binding were frequently outsourced. However, professional services like cataloging and reference services were also outsourced. Outsourcing was most widely used in private and medium scale universities in urban areas. They expected that the use of outsourcing would continue to expand at such universities in the future.

**Satpathy (2008)** prepared a project document for the revival and development of Govt. Ahilya Central Library, Indore. He recommended one-time outsourcing of library activities i.e. classification and cataloguing and suggested that outsourcing of backlog work could be given to other agencies like IIM, Indore on a project basis.

**Yu (2008)** reported that outsourcing of book-acquisition and cataloguing was a natural trend in university libraries. He comprehensively stated the implementation methods, rules and detailed operations etc. of the outsourcing of book-acquisition and cataloguing in academic libraries. He pointed out that academic libraries should build a strong support against the commercial corruption at the main source in the outsourcing of book-acquisition and cataloguing.

**Yuehua (2008)** surveyed the situation of outsourcing of acquisition and cataloging in academic libraries at Guangzhou. He reported that academic libraries faced some problems such as outsourcing quality, selection of booksellers and so on. Outsourcing was not a homogeneous practice in academic libraries. Further he mentioned that according to the difference of outsourcing motivations, the libraries could be separated as three types: the pure adaptability type, the pure efficiency type, and the non-fully motivation type. He believed that, these separations were prerequisite for further discussing and evaluating the outsourcing practice.
Decman (2007) surveyed the outsourcing of different services and sub services related to digital archiving in public and private organizations of Slovenia. He reported that the public sector was more interested in outsourcing than the private sector and mostly outsourcing was already done in the field of backup services, digitization services and archiving hardware/software. He found that the interest for outsourcing in general also increased due to limited budgets of organizations, importance of citizen-client perspective, public-private partnership tendencies, continuous changes in IT and customer/ business culture. Outsourcing the services of digital archiving could bring cheaper service and advanced technological solutions that do not demand a lot of human resources and technical and expert knowledge from the organization. Further he also proved that there existed a fair amount of interest for outsourcing of a long term electronic preservations services and related sub-servises. In the end he mentioned that outsourcing was an appropriate solution for digital preservation and suggested public administration bodies or private sector organisations to use this option.

Hasegawa (2007) investigated the current state of outsourcing in special libraries in Japan and revealed three trends- first outsourcing was introduced by 53.7% of the special libraries (16.2% of them with full-time outsourcing and 37.5% of them with temporary outsourcing). A higher proportion of outsourcing was introduced by large-scale libraries than by small-scale ones. Second the operational content of outsourcing had shifted from general to specialized and full-time outsourcing was particularly likely to entrust specialized content. Third, in the past, outsourcing was introduced to alleviate labor shortages, but it was then recognized as an effective system for both cutting costs and making use of specialists. He concluded that further study was necessary to determine whether entrusters should include such operational contents as planning and selection of materials within the range of their outsourcing. To maintain a high level of quality in library services there was an urgent need for entursters in the course of selecting contractors, to give careful considerations to the contract workers’ expert knowledge and skills.
Matoria, Upadhyay and Moni (2007) studied the design, development and implementation of the e-Granthalaya software in India’s public libraries. They mentioned that e-Granthalaya was crucial and required outsourcing if the library collection was more than 10,000 titles. Some of the SCLs (State Central Libraries) entered the data in-house with the existing staff while other libraries with fewer staff explored ways to outsource the data entry job.

Organ and Mandl (2007) outlined the experiences of University of Wollongong, Australia, in selecting a proprietary software solution ‘Digital Common’ for its open access digital repository requirements. They found an outsourced, proprietary software solution that was an appropriate digital repository option for higher education institutions when costs were considered and compared to locally housed, open source solutions such as DSpace or ePrints especially when on-site IT support was limited. Outsourcing allowed local staff to concentrate on liaison with faculty in promoting and populating the repository.

Ushizaki (2007) studied the status of the outsourcing in academic libraries in Japan and discussed the problems faced by college and university libraries in outsourcing. He pointed out that budget cuts, pursuit of core competence and slowness of library cooperation were the causes of outsourcing. He pointed out the solutions for the problems of university libraries, outsourcing vendors and outsourced employees. Further he suggested that libraries needed to pay attention to the action plan prepared by National Institute of Informatics (NII), Japan for the library cooperative activities.

Iizawa (2007) reported that Meiji University Library used outsourcing for enhancement and sophistication of library services. He mentioned that outsourcing was mostly used for the routine cataloging task.

Nakajima (2007) opined that outsourcing was an unavoidable issue in present time. Doshisha University had outsourced all cataloging functions in April 2001. Staff reduction in the cataloging department successfully enabled reallocation of the staff to more strategic areas at that time. However, the
cataloging department had experienced various problems on site. Under the restricted budget, site supervisors were given no other choice than maximizing the effectiveness of outsourcing. Among needed improvements from various angles, the "specification sheet" and "evaluation check" were key issues in a relationship with the outsourcing vendor.

Hill., Madarash-Hill and Allred (2007) reported that with the advent of digital reference, the outsourcing of a portion of public service was possible, enabling libraries to offer more hours of service at a lower cost with little awareness on the part of users. Since fall 2003, librarians at Southeastern Louisiana University had teamed up with librarians employed by a partner library and/or Tutor.com's Librarians By Request to provide a 24/7 digital reference service. A comparative analysis of digital reference transcripts and user satisfaction surveys indicated that external librarians could provide good digital reference service with a high level of user satisfaction.

Urs (2007) discussed the issues and challenges related to digital libraries in India. She found that most of the digital library initiatives, outsourced the digitization work to some reliable vendors. However, it was important to remember that outsourcing also demanded significant attention in terms of ensuring quality through stringent specifications, proper workflow, quality and audit processes.

Yu (2007) surveyed cataloguing operations of the 73 technological university and college libraries in Taiwan. He found that lack of manpower, accumulating backlogs, high turnover rate of student assistants, difficulty controlling the quality of cataloguing and limited chances of on-the job training were the five most frequently occurred issues on cataloguing operations. Many institutions were pursued a solution to these problems in two directions: by outsourcing cataloguing operations in an effective manner and by adopted a better automation infrastructure. He suggested that small sized libraries with a limited budget could start with outsourcing especially in formatted and foreign language materials to outside cataloguing services agencies. These two
categories often result in lower productivity for in-house cataloguers due to technical or linguistic capacity. However, it was important for a library to assign a cataloguer to supervise the whole process of outsourcing in order to control the quality of cataloguing and to guarantee that the work would be on time and within budget.

**Hall and Goody (2006)** studied the viability of outsourcing business research and information services in UK. They reported outsourcing activity that was more established in traditional LIS work, which included two main functions. First servicing library “space” e.g. security and cleaning and second facilitating document delivery e.g. journal subscription services. But now LIS outsourcing possibilities had extended from these two functions (which supported the provision of information services) to the delivery of information *per se*. Further they concluded that options for outsourcing in the domain of LIS had widened considerably in recent years.

**Kurukshetra University Library (2006)** Manuscript collection of Sharda, Persian, Bangla, Gurmukhi and Oriya scripts and Palm leaf manuscripts of JLN Library of Kurukshetra University, had been digitized free of cost by a Chandigarh based NGO “The Nanakshahi Trust”. The Trust provided this service using latest available technologies. University hoped that the Trust would consider their request of digitizing remaining manuscripts of Devnagri also. Campus-wide networking work of the university had been outsourced to the Haryana State Electronics Development Corporation.

**Fuller (2006)** studied the frequency and preparation factors in cataloguing of original materials in the 21st century. He found that majority of the academic libraries were relying on vendors for large percentage of the electronic data for their catalogues and the practice of cataloguing outsourcing has been increasing in academic libraries from 28% in 1997 to 70.2% in 2005.

**Gonzalez, Gasco and Llopis (2006)** studied the Information systems managers’ views about outsourcing in Spain and found that they considered outsourcing as a way to improve their information services. They opined that
outsourcing was not limited to small firms with limited resources; in fact, it had also been suitable to large companies and the main goal for information system outsourcing was improvement in information system rather than cost control.

Poll (2006) presented an overview of cost accounting methods and demonstrated how these methods could be used in a library. She found that all the libraries did not undertake cost accounting exercise, but these were necessary to run the institution smoothly and efficiently. By knowing the cost of specific tasks and services and comparing these costs with similar services offered by other institutions, the library could better judge what services should be offered internally or externally. It was often cost accounting that led to considerations of outsourcing. If the costs of in-house products in the library seemed too high, the library could compare its costs to prices for the same product available in the market. She concluded that decisions about outsourcing required careful consideration of all cost factors, including hidden costs and life cycle costs of equipments.

Singh (2006) found outsourcing and flexi-work force among the various emerging trends and developments taking place in special libraries in India. Tasks such as acquisition, cataloguing and classification, retro conversion, stock taking, compilation of bibliographies, automation of library and the like, all could be outsourced. This was common practice used in US to save manpower. However, many Indian libraries had started to outsource their routine work. Libraries had started adopting flexi-work force to save fringe benefits and employment costs. Such employees might be employed when needed, depending upon the quantity of work. Many libraries were eliminating many of their full-time professional positions. They rely on employment agencies to provide them with professionals, semi-professionals or non-professionals on a “hands on”, day-to- day basis, as and when needed, or libraries directly prepare a panel of people, who were called for work whenever needed.
Tsiang (2006) described that UCLA East Asian library initially considered the outsourcing as an alternative for eliminating the backlog of cataloguing of Chinese monographs but later library expanded the outsourcing project to the entire cataloguing backlog, including Japanese and Korean materials. She considered that outsourcing cataloguing has both obvious advantages and disadvantages. She reported that outsourcing was a controversial issue that could affect the future of the library profession. Those in favour emphasized that outsourcing saved library budgets and speeds up the cataloguing process, helped libraries to get specialized service, centralized library functions to specialists in the field and went along with the trends of privatization and globalization. Those opposed felt that outsourcing diminished the library profession, lowered the quality of library services and reduced the job market for qualified library workers. In general, those in favour looked at the issue from the point of view of management and those opposed looked at it from the socio-economic point of view.

Malhan (2006) discussed the problems and challenges of change management in the Indian university libraries to facilitate their growth, resource management and services performance similar to the work culture of the corporate sector. He studied the change management at the library of University of Jammu and reported that privatization of some of the sections e.g. reprography and the internet access were just happening at some libraries to improve efficiency, eliminate problems and achieve the desired quality of work. To achieve the time targets of project based work, some libraries were even getting the work done through outsourcing e.g. retro-conversion of card catalogues, introduction of RFID technology.

James (2005) reported that outsourcing of technical services was very common in small libraries. She mentioned both the pros and cons of outsourcing for small libraries on the basis of previous studies and concluded that outsourcing was used by the libraries when needed with a good contract and with good monitoring of quality.
Aoyagi (2005) undertook two case studies of corporate libraries in Japan and reported that it was necessary to examine whether the outsourcing was being requested by the parent organizations not to restructure and downsize library resources, but as a strategy to promote the growth of this sector of the organization. She found that corporate libraries tend to use strategic outsourcing in an effort to strengthen their competitive positions by maintaining the quality of their information service. Daily administrative and planning tasks were done in-house, whereas operations such a material collection, cataloguing and the supply of references services were outsourced. She concluded that it was highly necessary for corporate libraries to train their employees as library managers and for outsourcers to supply corporate libraries with information service providers through the systematization of human resources development programs.

Hiraoka (2005) reported that outsourcing process had positive effects with increased efficiency and a high level of services at Edogawa University, Japan.

Ti Yu (2005) surveyed the libraries of Taiwanese Institute of Technology and Technology College regarding catalogue outsourcing operations and the criteria in making such decisions. He indicated that 85% of the surveyed libraries had outsourced cataloguing operations. “Post transfer item-by-item check” was most widely used quality checking procedure which implies the quality of outsourced parties still varied in range. He mentioned that lack of the required human resources was the key decision factor for using outsourcing in cataloguing.

Lam (2005) investigated the quality control issues in cataloguing outsourcing programs implemented in US and Canadian academic libraries. He reported that most of the libraries provided the detailed cataloging and/or processing specifications to outsourcing vendors before the outsourcing programs started. They had set up quality control procedures as an integral part of their outsourcing operations. Both librarian-catalogers and senior library assistants/technicians were involved in the quality control programs. The error
rates reported were low and the majority of bibliographic records provided by
the vendors were either as per LC/OCLC records or records compatible with
the Core-Level Standard recommended by the Cooperative Cataloging
Council's Task Group on Standards. A large majority of these libraries were
satisfied with the services provided by the outsourcing vendors. Based on the
definition of quality of cataloguing as a combination of accuracy, consistency,
adequacy of access points and timeliness, most of the libraries reported that the
quality of their library’s cataloguing was not affected by the outsourcing
programs.

Bibliographic Services Task Force (2005) reported use of outsourcing to
handle languages and formats in which the library staff lacked expertise by
University of California libraries since library outsource majority of the
standard MARC cataloging, library staff could focus on new and expanded
uses of metadata. The cost of such outsourcing, though, might outweigh the
benefits.

Hosono (2005) reported that 25% of the universities in Japan had outsourced
their cataloguing process and mentioned that outsourcing brings benefits to the
libraries such as reducing costs and maintaining consistency. This also means
that fewer and fewer catalogers were trained in academic libraries and forced
the libraries to rely increasingly on outside contractors.

IIT Bombay (2004-05) mentioned getting 5700 volumes bound through
outsourcing in 2004-05 and that a commercial vendor provided photocopying
services in the library premises.

Ministry of Culture (2004-05) Central Secretariat Library (CSL) had awarded
the work of digitization of Commission and Committee Reports of post-
Independent India to an outsourced agency and 12 lakh pages of these reports
were processed by this agency.

Chiang (2004) surveyed the quality control and performance evaluation for
cataloging outsourcing in 89 University and College Libraries of Taiwan. She
reported that due to downsizing and ever-tighter budgets, outsourcing
cataloguing was a common trend in many academic libraries in Taiwan. She examined several aspects of outsourcing e.g. what materials libraries were outsourcing, whether libraries performed quality control on outsourced materials, how many of them do it and how they evaluate their outsourcing programs. She found that 76.6% of the libraries had outsourced the new acquisition materials. Vendors supplied the acquisition materials along with cataloguing records and/or physical processing. 64.1% libraries reported that they had quality control as an integrant part of the outsourcing program. Almost half of the libraries conducted cost and efficiency analysis, but not systematically and consistently, due to man power shortage, lack of the knowledge of evaluating criteria and the indifference of the top administration. Nevertheless, in all libraries a faster turnaround time was sufficient to justify their decision on outsourcing. Finally, she proposed some strategies and solutions for planning and implementing a successful outsourcing program.

Singh (2004) discussed the approach related to development and management of library databases. He mentioned that there were two ways of data entry for retro conversion - outsourcing and in-house data entry. Under outsourcing, either a professional agency could be hired or professional data entry operators could be engaged for data entry of reading material in the libraries. Each mode had its own advantages and disadvantages. Some librarians might advocate the hiring of professional agency for retro conversion; some might argue in favour of data entry operators, some might prefer data entry by their own staff. The libraries which did not have sufficient staff supported outsourcing of data entry. About 40% were in favour of data entry by a professional agency, while the rest were proponents of hired professionally competent data entry operators. The second mode (data entry by data entry operators) was used at LBS National Academy of Administration, Mussoorie in 1991.

Karte (2004) discussed the various myths about digital library initiatives in India. He opined that outsourcing of entire digitization and integration work
would not give experience to library staff. Managing and sustaining such digital library would be difficult for inexperienced library staff.

**Konnur and Bhandi (2004)** stated that to face the coming challenges of the 21st century; academic libraries would need to acquire more perspectives and new competencies. They reported that outsourcing was one of the most controversial topics discussed in libraries. Some librarians argued that in many cases it was adopted for the wrong reasons and without research or backup needed to make the operation successful, while others considered outsourcing to be an effective tool for improving services. Therefore, there is a need to revisit the possibility of outsourcing. It scared people who had the legitimate concerns and made them suspicious of any type of outsourcing. A “middle ground” objective approach to outsourcing was probably the best approach. It would allow staff to eliminate lots of labor-intensive work, help them to focus on the in-house tasks and use their skills to do the best.

**Venkamma (2004)** reported that the Department of Public Libraries, Andhra Pradesh had established two scanning centers at Hyderabad under Universal Digital Library Project- first in State Central Library, Afzalgunj and second in City Central Library, Ashoknagar at Hyderabad. She mentioned that scanning work was outsourced to private agencies on contract basis.

**Pantry and Griffiths (2004)** stated that outsourcing of library and information services was not new because libraries had outsourced various routine tasks such as the preparation of catalogue cards, labeling of books, cleaning and maintenance of buildings from a long time. They reported that for successful outsourcing it must be planned systematically and explained the logical and detailed process of the successive stages of outsourcing. Before considering outsourcing as an option the information audit of the existing organization should be done. Further they mentioned the various stages of outsourcing process in details e.g. vendor selection, making the agreement, handling of the copyright and license issues and contract duration etc. They also informed about the outsourcing contract elements, structure and format of the agreement.
In the end they suggested a range of strategies for ensuring the success of the outsourced services. They certainly mentioned everything in detail that an information professional needed to know in the complex issue of outsourcing.

**Vellucci (2004)** examined the commercial services available for providing authority control in online catalogs. She found various common reasons viz. authority control is labour intensive, controlled costs and increased efficiency were cited by librarians to use outsourcing for the authority control and reported that three types of authority control services - retrospective cleanup of the authority and bibliographic files, authority control work for newly cataloged bibliographic records and previously cataloged records where headings had changed and periodic file reauthorizations when there was a one-time retrospective authority control database cleanup, but the library did not contract out ongoing authority control services. Further three phases of the outsourced authority control process were discussed including preprocessing, Machine match against master authority files and Manual review and correction.

**Mikulas and Kontos (2004)** studied outsourcing practices in 20 County libraries in Hungary and opined that as this concept was so little known neither the library institute nor other bodies carried out research in this field. They reported that the activities which had no close connection with librarianship were outsourced, e.g. surveillance of building, digitization, canteen, facility management, homepage management, cleaning and microfilming. Almost 50% libraries agreed that the outsourcing was a tool for purchasing non-librarian professionalism. Further they mentioned the possible benefits of outsourcing e.g. saving staff time, saving money and raising quality of work etc. They concluded that outsourcing was a technique of enhancing the service of public libraries. Most of the county librarians believed that the outsourcing was very expensive. So, they would not be able use it for library-professional tasks.

**Ball (2003)** described experiences of outsourcing and externalization in libraries, museums and archives. He identified nine cultural, economic and
functional factors and stated that these factors should be considered for assessing the suitability of a service for outsourcing. For this purpose a ‘weighted decision matrix’ was developed as a tool for judging the suitability of library services for outsourcing.

**Lesky (2003)** reported the various advantages of the selective outsourcing and addressed some common myths about the outsourcing. She mentioned that appropriate and actively managed outsourcing could enable internal staff to provide more and better services. It was not simply a matter of saving money, although that could certainly be expected in many situations. She concluded that outsourcing became a permanent part of the information manager’s tool kit, used as necessary and kept sharp (by maintaining relationships with suppliers) when not in use.

**Whitlatch (2003)** reported three possible scenarios for the future of reference services. *Firstly* outsourcing, *secondly* the Web and *thirdly* knowledge counseling.

**Ebbinghouse (2002)** concluded that if outsourcing was the librarian’s idea then it was practical and prudent solution. Law librarians had a lot experience in implementation of outsourcing in law libraries. He also opined that outsourcing of specific library work would continue in the next 5 to 10 years and might become even more common.

**El-Sherbini (2002)** surveyed the outsourcing of Slavic cataloguing at the Ohio State university library and concluded that outsourcing would be viewed as a remote extension of technical services and sometimes it was the only solution. However, she had fears like outsourcing might not solve all the problems and it could be time consuming and frustrating. However, according to her outsourcing was not a threat to the professional cataloguers.

**Urquhart (2002)** described various types of outsourcing arrangements used in information systems and explained some of the theoretical perspectives that could be invoked to explain the behaviour of client, supplier and intermediary organisations, such as customer consortia. He also examined some of the
problems of outsourcing in the public sector and suggested how the theoretical perspectives might illuminate some of the problems which had emerged in the purchasing and licensing of electronic contents.

**Sweetland (2001)** while reviewing the existing literature on outsourcing from 1990 to 2000 and found sufficient literature in favour of outsourcing that it saved money and time while some data reflected a decline in quality in many outsourcing projects.

**Reddy (2001)** described an action plan for the digitization of university libraries. He reported that it might be possible to outsource all or most of the functions of a digital library. Alternatively, it might be possible to buy access to external search and delivery services, which cover most of the library’s requirements in the digital era. He suggested that the task of digital library given to another organization might be the best way to achieve it and run it. The process of retrospectively digitizing the material from the selected collections was highly specialized work and needed expensive equipment for the best results since, it was done once, contracting for the services might be the most –cost effective way. Once the material had been digitized it was worth considering the costs of making it available for access.

**Case (2001)** studied the NASA (National Aeronautics and Space Administration) Glenn Research Center library and examined strictures related to outsourcing. She found that the technical library at NASA’s Glenn Research Center outsourced the majority of its technical services to D & K Associates. Cost was the primary focus for most libraries in considering outsourcing as an option.

**Worthington (2000)** mentioned that outsourcing of technical and user services could improve the delivery of services, but involved the risk of loss of control of quality and costs. He stated that outsourcing was a valid tool and it could be used with IT in a library. Internet could be used to deliver library services. However, it required new skills for the people involved both in the outsourcing client organisation and the outsourcing company. The library would consised
of a bundle of web based services: the catalogue, research and information services. E-books, journals and newspapers would be provided online via contracts with content owners. Services which could not be delivered via a web interface would be available by e-mail. It should be noted that the bundle of services which a library did not need to provide by one organisation in one physical location, nor there was need of an actual collection of books, as in a conventional library (books could be sourced from separate specialised sources or printed on demand). In a way a current library was a type of outsourcing organisation: contracting with various suppliers of goods and services to supply an integrated service to their borrowers.

Appleby (2000) concluded that public libraries would outsource more technical services operations in the future and would permit libraries to make better use of human resources, gain expertise that was not available in-house, focus on more essential public services, reduced operation costs and made funds available for other operations. More importantly outsourcing might enable public librarians to develop more user tools, classify more electronic resources and respond to more information needs.

Martin, et al. (2000) examined outsourcing of cataloging selection and management by investigating two case studies, the Hawaii Public Library System and the Forth Worth Public Library System for selection and the National Aeronautics and Space Administration and the Riverside County Library System for management. The study concluded that there was no evidence that outsourcing per se had had a negative impact on library services and management. They found outsourcing had been an effective management tool and when used carefully and judiciously it had resulted in enhanced library services and improved library management. Instance where problems had arisen subsequent to decisions to outsource aspects of library operations and functions appeared to be attributable to inadequate planning, poor contracting processes or ineffective management of contracts.
White (2000) discussed the concept of outsourcing in libraries and suggested that it was done for the cosmetic appearance of fiscal economies. He agreed that there were valid reasons to outsource library operations. Cost effectiveness was often achieved by hiring a firm that already had the skills, equipment and staff to do the job. They could perform the job better and at a lower cost, without effecting quality. Often, a backlog of work could be eliminated through outsourcing. It was especially true for technical service functions. However, he warned, the cost savings were not worth much if libraries lose quality of service. No contractor could possibly match the quality of understanding, caring and interest as internal staff contributed to the organization.

Williams and Barone (2000) reported technical services outsourcing as a way to control costs and distribute labor. Outsourcing of technical services in academic libraries an emerging trend hotly debated in library profession. Although outsourcing might be more prevalent in the larger institutions, it had enough applications and implications to warrant study in a small institution. They focused on determining the viable outsourcing options for three collections: standing orders, firm orders, and audiotapes in a library serving the needs of an undergraduate public liberal arts institution. Reasons for exploring outsourcing included a reduction in paraprofessional staff, a restructuring of professional staff and a desire to experiment with workflow.

Helfer (2000) reported that if outsourcing was the only or best way to get a project done, librarians should not hesitate to use it. Librarians needed to guard against the perceptions in organizations that they only waste corporate resources. Librarians constantly needed to prove their value not only to their immediate customers, who knew and appreciated them, but also to middle and upper management, who frequently only saw them as bottom line numbers on a spreadsheet. Librarians needed to boast, to let management know on a regular basis how they contributed to the bottom line and success of the organization.
If they did that, outsourcing would be their friend and ally. If they did not, outsourcing would replace them.

**Urban Libraries Council (1999)** surveyed 127 member libraries however, 72 member libraries responded. The libraries reported that half anticipated outsourcing more functions in the future and 47% would anticipate the same amount of outsourcing. No library anticipated decreasing the functions outsourced. Cataloging was reported outsourced by 61% of the respondent libraries and 68% were outsourcing at least 40% of their materials processing. In comparison, binding was outsourced by 82% of the respondents and 97% of the binding was outsourced. Commercial vendors were the source of outsourced cataloging 71% among those reporting outsourcing. Other sources were government agencies (15%), library consortia (5%), other non-profit agencies (5%) and other libraries (3%) The respondent libraries reported outsourcing was an established practice with all but two of the functions queried had been outsourced on an average of five years or more. Outsourcing of Internet service provision and web page design and maintenance were recent technological innovations and not highly outsourced among libraries responding to this survey. Over half of the outsourced functions had been outsourced ten or more years. Among the urban library council libraries responding, outsourcing was not significantly driven by government mandates. Those who outsource mandated only three functions: cataloguing, payroll and other personnel function. Outsourcing of cataloguing was mandated for 31% of those outsourcing this function. The most important reasons for outsourcing were better use of staff, increased efficiency, better customer service and cost savings.

**Bénaud and Bordeianu (1998)** examined the entire gamut of outsourcing possibilities in academic libraries which was based on an extensive literature review as well as a survey of over 200 academic libraries included 109 members of the Association of Research Libraries (ARL) and 110 medium-sized non-ARL academic libraries. But only 69 ARL and 70 non-ARL
academic libraries was responded. They surveyed libraries about their outsourcing activities in all functional areas of librarianship e.g. collection development, acquisitions, preservation, reference, interlibrary loan, document delivery, systems, cataloging, authority control and retrospective conversion. They provide a historical overview of outsourcing in each area and then describe current practices. They found that 49 (71%) of ARL libraries and 39 (56%) of non-ARL libraries were outsourcing cataloging functions. Total 88% libraries reported outsourcing cataloging functions. Main vendors listed were Marcive (44%), TECHPRO (25%), and Prompt Cat (18%). 27% libraries were also buying value-added services like labeling (17%) table of contents (12%) security taping (15%). 29% libraries indicated they had no plans to outsource in this area while 28% libraries indicated that they did have outsourcing plans. 60% libraries indicated they did or had outsourced retrospective conversion. Further they opined that libraries with higher budgets tend to outsource more than those with smaller budgets. Despite the controversy surrounding this topic, they concluded that libraries are taking a cautious approach to outsourcing.

Wilson and Colver (1997) reported the experiences of libraries that had successfully used outsourcing in various library operations for at least one year. They studied 16 case which cover academic, public and special libraries. The outsourced library operations include authority control, selection, collection enhancement and expansion, database maintenance, document delivery, original and copy cataloging and record enrichment with table of contents etc. Each case study includes detail of the library background, outsourcing project and its objectives and results. Every case study provides details not only about the specific operation but also about the impact of outsourcing on the library as a whole.

Portugal (1997) examined the outsourcing in seven corporate libraries from which two firms had already outsourced library services and others outsourced selectively. He reported the various type of outsourcing implemented in
corporate libraries e.g. total, partial and tentative. He found four main reasons for outsourcing library service viz. cost reduction, centralizing services, control of access to information and a renewed emphasis on business information. He concluded that outsourcing was posing a real threat to corporate libraries. Also, no company had any means of evaluating the benefits of the outsourcing currently being done.

**Hirshon and Winters (1996)** designed a comprehensive a step-by-step guide to walk librarians through the steps of reengineering, outsourcing and the procurement process. They successfully initiated the total outsourcing of cataloging at Wright State University. They discussed outsourcing within the broader context of re-engineering and describe situations when outsourcing was appropriate. They presented various methodologies for conducting cost studies, and goes into much detail about the preparation of RFPs (requests for proposal) including sample RFPs for outsourcing cataloging, serial subscription services, and approval plans. They also covered vendor responses related to the RFP, the contract and the human factors. They mentioned that “....outsourcing is not an objective, but a tool. Simply put, a library should not set out to outsource. Rather, the library should look for ways to improve its internal processes and to become as efficient and as effective as possible. Before a library engages the services of an outside vendor, it is essential to first undergo process reengineering to ensure that outsourcing is indeed the best course of action.”

**Johnston (1996)** demonstrated that outsourcing was not a new phenomenon in libraries especially in the field of cataloguing. She described the success of two major projects of 1987 and 1991 using outsourcing at Notre Dame Library. Further she reported reasons to consider outsourcing and potential benefits of outsourcing. She mentioned that outsourcing was particularly beneficial in completing specific activities and projects, rather than eliminating whole departments or libraries. She suggested that whether we like it or not, we must all accept outsourcing as a possible tool to use in the performance of our jobs.
Kascus and Hale (1995) provided a complete checklist that a library needs to take into consideration when embarking on an outsourcing project. Librarian could make their decision easier regarding whether or not to outsource by using this checklist. They mentioned the in detail which things should be consider before taking the decision to outsource the cataloguing, authority work and physical processing of materials.
2.2 REFERENCES


Bibliographic Services Task Force, 2005. *Rethinking how we provide bibliographic services for the University of California: final report*, [online].


King, Rebecca and Terzi, Lori., 2008. To outsource or not to outsource technical services in public libraries?. *LIBR285*, School of library and Information Science: San Jose State University.


Macroplan Australia Pty Ltd., 2010. *A cost benefit analysis: outsourcing of acquisitions, cataloguing and processing in NSW public libraries*, [online].


Robertson, Sharon., 2008. Outsourcing of selection and shelf ready services, [online].

Robertson, Sharon., 2009. Brisbane city council library service: outsourcing of selection shelf ready services, [online].


Sato, Sho and Itsumura, Hiroshi., 2009. The correlation between library and information education and outsourcing in academic libraries. In: Graduate School of Library, Information and Media Studies, University of Tsukuba, Research Center of Knowledge Communities, University of Tsukuba and Japan Society of Library and Information Science (JSLIS), A-LIEP (*Asia-Pacific Conference on Library and Information Education and Practice*) preparing information professionals for international collaboration, University of Tsukuba, 6-8 March 2009. Japan: University of Tsukuba.


